CITY OF SAN ANTONIO

OFFICE OF THE CITY AUDITOR

Follow-Up Audit of
San Antonio Airport Police Department Operations

Project No. AU21-F01

September 24, 2021

Kevin W. Barthold, CPA, CIA, CISA
City Auditor

Executive Summary

As part of our annual Audit Plan approved by City Council, we conducted a follow-up audit of the recommendations made in the Audit of San Antonio Airport Police Department (SAAPD) Operations dated July 23, 2020. The objective for this follow-up audit is:

Determine if recommendations from the most recent audit of Airport Police operations have been effectively implemented.

We determined that SAAPD successfully implemented all prior audit recommendations including the need to improve its administrative processes to better ensure that personnel receive the required training, equipment and supplies are tracked and maintained, access to information systems is authorized and appropriate, complaints against officers are promptly investigated, the screening process for volunteers is adequately documented, and its Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) are up-to-date and reflect actual practice.

We commend the department on the significant improvements it has made since the prior audit, which included assigning new personnel to act as Quartermaster, Training Sergeant, and Internal Affairs Sergeant; making significant updates to its General Manual; completely reorganizing its inventory stores to ensure all equipment is properly stowed and maintained; and finally, creating logs to track its administrative processes so that deadlines and training requirements are met.

There were no audit findings identified in this audit and we make no recommendations. Consequently, no management responses are required. SAAPD management's acknowledgement of these results is in Appendix B on page 9.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary i

Background 1

Audit Scope and Methodology 2

Prior Audit Recommendations and Status 3

A. Training and Application Files 3

B. Equipment, Inventory, and Maintenance 4

C. Complaints 4

D. Access Controls 5

E. Volunteers in Airport Policing 6

F. Standard Operating Procedures 6

Appendix A – Staff Acknowledgement 8

Appendix B – Management Acknowledgement 9

Background

On July 23, 2020, the Office of the City Auditor issued an audit of the San Antonio Airport Police Department Operations. The objective of the audit was as follows:

Determine if Airport Police operations are managed effectively and efficiently to include compliance with training requirements of the State of Texas and the City.

The Office of the City Auditor concluded that SAAPD needed to improve its administrative processes to better ensure that personnel receive the required training, equipment and supplies are tracked and maintained, access to information systems is authorized and appropriate, complaints against officers are promptly investigated, the screening process for volunteers is adequately documented, and its Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) are up-to-date and reflect actual practice.

SAAPD management agreed with the conclusions and developed action plans to address the audit recommendations.

Audit Scope and Methodology

The audit scope was limited to the recommendations and corrective action plans made in the original report for the time frame July 1, 2020 through March 31, 2021. In some cases, we expanded the scope to include the current status and observations as applicable, such as inventory observations and tests of user access.

We interviewed staff and physically inspected inventories. We conducted tests of training files, internal affairs case tracking logs, volunteer personnel files and user access to various information technology systems used by SAAPD. We also reviewed changes to the SAAPD General Manual and Standard Operating Procedures. Testing criteria included federal and state training requirements, General Manual and Standard Operation Procedures, and prudent business practices.

We assessed internal controls relevant to the audit objective. This included a review of policies and procedures, tracking logs, and maintenance of various types of personnel files and management reports.

We relied on computer-processed data in the SAP accounting system showing last dates of employment and employee department to validate current user access to various IT systems. We do not believe that the absence of testing general and application controls had an effect on the results of our audit.

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

Prior Audit Recommendations and Status

A. Training and Application Files

Prior Recommendations:

The Chief of Police should ensure that:

- The training officer creates a checklist to use in each training file that encompasses all requirements imposed by the SAAPD General Manual and SOPs, as well as all Texas Commission on Law Enforcement (TCOLE) and federally or state mandated training.
- A comprehensive review of all officers' training is completed, and additional training courses are taken as needed to ensure compliance with all applicable requirements.
- Officers are strongly encouraged to turn in all training certificates to the training officer in a timely manner and the training officer reports any deficiencies in documentation or training in the quarterly training self-audits.
- Its SOPs are updated to ensure that officers returning to duty from any type of extended leave or suspension are qualified to receive all their equipment before returning it to them.
- The department reviews its SOPs and finalizes the training requirements it will enforce. (See also Issue F.)

Status: Implemented

SAAPD is now adequately monitoring and tracking compliance with training requirements and has improved its record-keeping for training.

SAAPD created several logs which identify training required by federal and state law, as well as training required by the City and the Department. Training courses taken by all personnel are tracked in these logs. We verified that the logs tracked all pertinent requirements. We also selected a sample of 10 officers and tested that they had taken all required training during the scope period of the audit and that this training was adequately tracked via the log files.

We also reviewed the three most recent (if applicable) quarterly self-audits of training course reviews and personnel training files, the applicant processing monthly reviews, and the weekly In-Service status reports. Due to the pandemic, the self-audits performed varied from the norm as there were no newly hired personnel and in-person training was vastly reduced. The reports also indicated that personnel files were routinely reviewed and obsolete files were purged.

B. Equipment, Inventory, and Maintenance

Prior Recommendations:
The Chief of Police should:

- Ensure that inventories are kept up to date with all equipment listed.
- Use the equipment inventories to ensure that all equipment has been properly inspected, calibrated where necessary, and maintained as required.
- Dispose of obsolete inventory in a timely and appropriate manner.
- Acquire child safety seats, nerve agent antidote kits, and storage furniture or shelving as appropriate.
- Cross-train another officer to assist the Quartermaster with inventories as needed.
- Provide SAAPD personnel who have administrative duties basic training in Microsoft Excel to enhance productivity.

Status: Implemented

SAAPD has significantly improved its inventory processes since the prior audit.

We verified that child safety seats and nerve agent antidote kits have been purchased, that inventory has been properly organized and stored, and that administrative officers have been provided both Excel training and cross-training in each other's duties. We tested a sample of inventories and verified the equipment listed existed and was properly stored or in use. We also verified that radar maintenance was performed as required and that radios were sent for annual service.

C. Complaints

Prior Recommendations:

The Chief of Police should ensure:

- The complaint log is enhanced to include a closed date for each investigation and that the number of days outstanding for each complaint is automatically calculated.
- Justifications for investigations that exceed the current requirements are provided by the investigators and that these justifications are appropriate and documented prior to the SAAPD Commander's periodic review of the caseload.

Status: Implemented

SAAPD has improved its Internal Affairs processes since the prior audit.

SAAPD created and filled an Internal Affairs Sergeant position who is responsible for tracking all complaints. We verified that the complaint log has been enhanced to include all relevant dates, automatically calculate the due date of a complaint investigation, and color-code complaints as a reminder when they are close to being due or have become overdue. We tested to ensure the unit provides investigators with several reminders of the due dates of investigations to ensure they are promptly completed. If investigations are not completed on time, a justification is required. We verified that inadequate or missing justifications result in discipline by management. We also tested the log file to ensure that complaints were being completed in a timely manner.

D. Access Controls

Prior Recommendations:

The Chief of Police should:

- Amend SAAPD procedures for withdrawn employees and those going on extended leave (voluntary or involuntary) to include deactivation of system access in a timely manner.
- Conduct periodic reviews of employee access to information systems and remove users who are not appropriate.
- Ensure that access requests specify employee SAP number and Windows login ID (if different) to prevent confusion as to the correct user.

Status: Implemented

SAAPD has implemented new processes to ensure that employees' user access to information technology is terminated in a timely manner. It uses a checklist and standard email distribution list to ensure that every owner of every IT system that SAAPD uses is notified of the need to terminate a user's access. Several of those system owners, but not all, provide an acknowledgement that the user has been disabled.

We tested the process for five different users terminated since June 2020 and found that SAAPD had documentation supporting its request to terminate user access for all five.

We also tested user access for the following systems: Mark43 (police reporting), Evidence.com (body-worn camera and TASER system), FileOnQ (property and evidence system), CRASH (State vehicle accident system), SAPD Activity System (police activity recording system), Active Directory (Windows login), and Visinet/CAD (the 911 dispatch system). We found a minimal number of users in these systems that should have been terminated and were not. However, it is not due to a lack of diligence on the part of SAAPD management. They provided documentation of their requests for access terminations, including at least one

from the Public Safety ITSD team stating that the user had been deactivated. Thus, we make no recommendations to SAAPD management.

E. Volunteers in Airport Policing

Prior Recommendations:

The Chief of Police should ensure that:

- Its application materials and procedures are updated to reflect actual practice.
- Going forward, SAAPD retains documentation reflecting its vetting of the volunteers, including their applications, results of fingerprint checks, results of security clearances obtained via the Airport Badge/ID office, driving record checks (if applicable), and training records.

Status: Implemented

SAAPD has improved its administrative processes over the Volunteers in Airport Policing.

Rather than updating its application materials and procedures to reflect the practices in place during the prior audit, SAAPD updated its practices to reflect the application materials and procedures already in place. Furthermore, a personnel file was created for each volunteer. We tested the entire population of volunteer personnel files and noted that each contained the proper records.

F. Standard Operating Procedures

Prior Recommendations:

The Chief of Police should:

- Complete its review of any procedures or requirements adopted from the SAPD that need to be modified for SAAPD purposes.
- Eliminate procedures that SAAPD does not intend to follow or that are not applicable.
- Set a realistic review cycle for its SOPs.
- Ensure that periodic updates to SOPs and the General Manual include reviews of changes to referenced federal and state laws and regulations.
- Ensure self-audits of SOPs and the General Manual specify which sections were reviewed and a summary of recommended changes.

Status: Implemented

SAAPD has significantly updated its General Manual and Standard Operating Procedures since the prior audit.

We selected a sample of 26 General Manual sections and nine SOPs. We then compared them to the versions in place at the time of the prior audit. The revised procedures reflected basic updates to language and grammar, including reflecting the current organizational structure and oversight by the San Antonio Police Department (SAPD). Additionally, significant changes were made to streamline processes and reflect policy changes.

We also tested a sample of five police personnel to ensure that acknowledgements had been obtained from them showing they had received the updated General Manual and SOPs.

We also reviewed the most recent self-audits for the General Manual and SOPs, dated from January 2021 and found that they included a summary of the changes made either within the self-audit memorandum or on the newly created tracking spreadsheet. The spreadsheet tracks who reviewed each section of the General Manual and SOPs, when it was reviewed, and what changes, if any, were made in each annual review cycle.

Appendix A – Staff Acknowledgement

Mark Bigler, CPA-Utah, CISA, CFE, Audit Manager
Susan Van Hoozer, CIA, CISA, Auditor in Charge

Appendix B – Management Acknowledgement

CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
SAN ANTONIO TEXAS 78283-3966

August 23, 2021

Kevin W. Barthold, CPA, CIA, CISA
City Auditor
San Antonio, Texas

RE: Management's Acknowledgement of its Review of Follow-Up Audit of San Antonio Airport Police Department Operations

San Antonio Airport Police Department and San Antonio Police Department have reviewed the audit report and provided their comments to the auditors. As there are no recommendations for management, no management responses are required.

San Antonio Airport Police Department and San Antonio Police Department:

☑ Fully Agrees

☐ Does Not Agree (provide detailed comments)

Sincerely,

William P. McManus
Chief of Police
San Antonio Police Department

8/23/21
Date

María Villagómez
Deputy City Manager
City Manager's Office

9/2/2021
Date